

Strenghts	Weakness
The proposal is well written, and the scientific aims are clearly defined. HARPS is suitable to the project's goals and its spectra are the missing ingredient for a thorough characterization of the 4 targets. The observations may rule out a mono-aged nature of counter-rotating stars in the halo, thus changing current understanding of the Gaia-Enceladus merger event.	A clear estimate of the final accuracy on age is missing. No details have been given on experience of the observers with this or other instruments.
Timely project focussed on an hot topic of Galactic astronomy leaded by a strong team with a well established expertise in the field.	In red giant stars spectral properties are weak age tracers. Moreover, the s- and r- process abundance distribution in a galactic satellite can have a wide spread so, while their determination is anyway useful, their interpretation in the context of the origin of this stellar population could be difficult.
The proposal aims to study the nature of newly identified (Helmi et al 2018) Enceladus object, which is one of the hot topics in Galactic Astrophysics at the moment. Proposal is well written and argued, and requests a reasonable time investment (just over one night) with potentially a large scientific impact.	No obvious weaknesses.
Studying the characteristics of galactic counter-rotating stars is very timely giving the recent discovery of the Gaia-Enceladus stream. This project may reveal traces of relicts of other merging events, which is has a great impact particularly in the general public. Combination with asteroseismology is a further strength of the project.	The project may lead to the eventual identification of a handful of counter-rotating stars not belonging to the Gaia-Enceladus stream The impact on our general knowledge on the galactic formation and evolution processes that this may produce is unclear.
This propasal aims to shred light on the origin of the Milky Way, by trying to understand whether all metal-poor counter-rotating stars belong to the Gaia-Enceladus debris. HARPS spectra will be able to fully characterize the chemical profile of the target stars, providing information on their formation by reducing the age uncertainty. The requested S/N is well motivated.	The bigger picture (i.e. why understanding the origin of the Milky Way is so important) is not discussed. In Fig. 3 they refer to HERMES-N resolution instead of HARPS-N. Technicalities are not easy to understand for non experts.