Strenghts	Weakness
Spectroscopic observations with HARPS-N are proposed for three eclipsing binary star systems belonging to two open clusters; the goal is to determine the velocity curves of the binaries' components, and thus to derive their masses, radii, and ages. This looks like a very promising technique to derive physical parameters of individual stars with unprecedented high accuracy, and it is going to be very important to test and constrain theoretical models of stellar evolution.	Since the requested observations are part of a larger program aimed at measuring physical parameters in a large number of eclipsing binaries, a stronger case should have been made for the need of studying these three systems, e.g. providing a more detailed discussion of the targets' properties and/or peculiarities with respect to those of the other binaries studied by the team. The text was not clear and difficult to follow in many points. Section 15 describing the observer experience with TNG and/or other instruments is missing.
Very interesting project about spectroscopic observations of eclipsing binaries to obtain precise ages, masses, and radii. The project see the prosecution of a project with a few hours already obtained but not fully collected (see Point 8) which has produced results and publication. Small, but expert and tested team.	It is not well clear if the present project is the continuation of a project with a few hours already obtained but not fully collected (see Point 8) or the request for other new objects/observations related to the previous observations. The data required are the velocity amplitudes of tens of km/s, which is well above the resolution limit of HARPS-N, the telescope/instrument might be non used at its best, the team should better explain the need of HARPS-N.
The proposed project is the natural completion of a previously approved program. If intended as a test of the age determination procedure in stellar systems with already good age estimates, it represents a good benchmark for stellar evolution models.	The uncertainties in theoretical models reflect into the age of the binary components in a similar way as using a canonical isochrone fitting. For this reason, the expected improvement in the age determination is minimal. There is a also a significant risk of not achieving the proposed goal because of the tight observational constraints.
The turn off mass estimate for NGC1817 is relevant for the calibration of asteroseismic mass determinations from the scaling relations. However I have not yet found published Kepler results for this cluster.	Ages determined from M-R diagrams of eclipsing binaries are still subject to potentially sizeable uncertainties related to the stellar evolution models. For example, in case of M37 the 'infamous' issue of core convective overshooting efficiency, that affects evolutionary timescales and radius evolution. Will an additional age estimate for this cluster (still subject to model uncertainties) have a substantial scientific value?
The proposed observations are important to reduce the uncertainties on the age.	It is not clear how much information the observations of only three candidates will add to our knowledge.